

IN THE UNITED STATES PATENT OFFICE

5

In re Application J. K. MEHRA et al..
Metoprolol Manufacturing Process

10 Serial No. 10/807,221
Filed 23 March 2004

15 -----
DECLARATION

I, Janakraj Karamchand MEHRA, hereby swear as follows:

1. I am an inventor of record of the captioned patent application.
2. In 1963, I was awarded a Doctor of Philosophy degree (Technical) from Mumbai University, (Mumbai, India) under the guidance of Professor S. V. Sunthankar. I subsequently worked at the National Chemical Laboratory (Pune, India) and completed post-doctoral research in organic chemistry at Columbia University (New York City, U.S.A.) under the guidance of Professor Charles Dawson. Since then, I have worked for over thirty years as a pharmaceutical research chemist and as a manager of pharmaceutical research and of pharmaceutical manufacturing. I therefore believe that I am one of skill in the art of pharmaceutical chemistry.
3. I have reviewed the 30 December 2005 OFFICE ACTION and the art of record in this case.

20
25
30 **Novelty requirement under 35 U.S.C. Sec.102 (b)**

4. The method of US5082969 teaches the first step reaction at a temperature of 0-25°C (please see examples and claims). Further, the method of US 6252113 clearly states the reaction is to be carryout at a temperature range of 50-70 °C (for reasons of purity, please see description at col.2, lines 45-54 and claims). On the contrary, the instant invention clearly claims carrying

Janakraj K. MEHRA *et al.*,
Metoprolol Manufacturing Process
Serial No. 10/807,221

out the reaction at 42.5+2.5 °C. Thus we believe that the cited methods cannot be said to anticipate the instantly claimed temperature range.

5 5. Further, one of skill in the art would read RIBALTO BARO *et al.*, Examples 1-2 to teach a process forming 3-[4-(2-methoxyethyl)phenoxy]-1,2-epoxypropane contaminated with about 15-20% chlorohydrin compound. In contrast, the process of the instant invention yields essentially a single product, 3-[4-(2-methoxyethyl)phenoxy]-1,2-epoxypropane. Because the impurity yields are so different the method of US5082969 patent cannot be said to anticipate the instantly claimed method.

10 6. Furthermore, none of the cited methods discloses washings of the product at the specific pH range as claimed in the instant application for removing the impurities in the product (before employing the first step reaction product in the next stage). The cited references neither suggest nor imply such washing of product till a specific pH range will improve the quality of product. Thus the cited methods cannot be said to anticipate the instantly claimed pH range.

Obviousness rejection under 35 U.S.C. Sec. 103(a)

15 7. The advantages of the instant invention over the method of RIBALTO BARO *et al* are shorter reaction times; significant reduction of the reactants quantities used; limited or no contamination of chlorohydrins in the epoxy-intermediate 3-[4-(2-methoxyethyl)phenoxy]-1,2-epoxypropane; and the purity of the resulting epoxide compound. For example, the percentage of contaminating chlorohydrins in the method of Ribaldo Baro *et al* is 15 to 20% (pl. see examples and claims), in contrast to that it is formed only 0.5 to 1 % in the instant invention method. One 20 of skill in the art would not have expected these advantages based on the teachings of the prior art.

DECLARATION - Page 2

Janakraj K. MEHRA *et al.*,
Metoprolol Manufacturing Process
Serial No. 10/807,221

8. The method of PALMÉR *et al.*, on the other hand, teaches to carry out the reaction at a temperature range of 50-70 °C and having advantage of shorter reaction time. However, PALMÉR teaches distillation of the epoxide intermediate, namely 3-[4-(2-methoxyethyl)phenoxy]-1,2-epoxypropane, for sufficient purity in order to pursue for metoprolol base formation. PALMÉR does not teach water washings as an alternative to distillation of the intermediate compound under high vacuum. Also, PALMÉR fails to suggest or imply a process using the claimed pH range for water washings would improve the purity of the intermediate epoxide compound. To the contrary, PALMÉR emphasizes distillation of the intermediate compound as the only possible solution to achieve purity. See PALMÉR *et al* at col.2 lines 51-54. PALMÉR neither suggests nor implies the claimed solution.

9. The advantages of the instant invention over PALMÉR are: elimination of industrially unfriendly high vacuum distillation of product that requires special arrangements; and significantly improved yield & purity of intermediate as well as final metoprolol, which was made possible only with the claimed improvements. One of skill in the art would not have expected these advantages based on the teachings of PALMÉR alone nor combined with RIBALTO BARO.

10. It appears that the examiner considers distillation of epichlorohydrin in the instant invention and distillation of intermediate epoxide compound to be equivalent processes. This is not, however, correct. PALMÉR discloses the distillation of the end-product, not distillation of an intermediate reactant (epichlorohydrin). This alone is a sufficient showing that PALMÉR does not anticipate the claimed invention.

DECLARATION - Page 3

Janakraj K. MEHRA *et al.*,
Metoprolol Manufacturing Process
Serial No. 10/807,221

11. The art of record fails to teach that an adjustment of the pH of the water washings to the specific claimed range. The claimed improvement results into improved purity and avoids an industrially unfavorable process step of distilling the intermediate epoxide under high vacuum and that too with a 2-8% fore-cut. Cf. PALMÉR *et al.* at claims and specification. The art of record fails to show that one of skill in the art would have had a reasonable expectation of success with this process modification.

5 12. Similarly, RIBALTO BARO teaches to use isopropyl amine in about 16 molar excess to the starting epoxide. In contrast, but the claimed invention makes possible lowering the amounts of isopropyl amine significantly. This totally eliminates the need to use a pressure vessel, an apparatus required by the prior art methods. See RIBALTO BARO *et al.*, col 2, lines 24-28 and example #2).

Unexpected Synergistic Results

10 13. PALMÉR and Ribalta Baro *et al.* are respectfully believed to support the patentability of our method. A side-by-side comparison of our invention and the process of PALMÉR, at col. 2, lines 45-54 shows that our invention produces a significantly greater yield and purity without the need for distillation of epoxy-intermediate 3-[4-(2-methoxyethyl)phenoxy]-1,2-epoxypropane. Our process enables an yield of up to 93 to 95%, with a purity from 97 to 99% in case of 3-[4-(2-methoxyethyl)phenoxy]-1,2-epoxypropane. See instant specification at example 1. In contrast, PALMÉR at column 2, lines 45-54 and examples, concedes only 80% yield with a purity of 96 to 98% in the first step.

20 14. A side by side comparison of our invention with process of RIBALTO BARO *et al.* examples 1 and 2 indicates that our process is more economical and environmentally friendly. The RIBALTO BARO method itself is inferior in achieving higher purity as taught/observed by

Janakraj K. MEHRA *et al.*,
Metoprolol Manufacturing Process
Serial No. 10/807,221

others (*see* admissions of PALMÉR *et al.*) such as: the intermediate contamination of with chlorohydrins; longer reaction times; use of volatile isopropyl amine in large excess (16 times vs 5.5 times by molar weight in the claimed invention) to effect metoprolol base forming reaction; and the purity of intermediate compound.

5 15. Our results would not have been expected by one of skill in the art.

16. There is a nexus between this evidence and the pending patent claims, because this evidence would be considered by one of skill in the art to have probative value in showing the pending patent claims are non-obvious in light of the art of record.

10 I hereby declare that all statements made herein of my own knowledge are true and that all statements made on information and belief are believed to be true; and further that these statements were made with the knowledge that willful false statements and the like so made are punishable by fine or imprisonment or both, under Section 1001 of Title 18 of the United States Code, and that such willful false statements may jeopardize the validity of the application, any patent issuing thereon or any patent to which this verified statement is directed.

15

20 Janakraj Karamchand MEHRA, Ph.D.
Dated as of 20 March 2006

25 SD/Nexin/10.442,985 Amendment.doc

DECLARATION – Page 5

BEST AVAILABLE COPY

WED, 22-MAR-06 5:23 IPCA CRD

91 22 56474757

P. 06

Jessakai K. MEHTA, Ph.D.
 Metoprolol Manufacturing Process
 Serial No.: 10/607,221

others (see admissions of PALMER *et al.*) suggest the intermediate contamination of with chlorhydrins; longer reaction times; use of volatile isopropyl amine in large excess (16 times vs. 5.5 times by molar weight in the claimed invention) to effect metoprolol base forming reaction; and the purity of intermediate compound.

15. Our results would not have been expected by one of skill in the art.

16. There is no nexus between this evidence and the pending patent claims, because this evidence would be considered by one of skill in the art to have probative value in showing the pending patent claims are non-obvious in light of the record.

10 I hereby declare that all statements made herein are true to the best of my knowledge and belief; that all statements made on information and belief are believed to be true; and further that these statements were made with the knowledge that willful false statements and the like so made are punishable by fine or imprisonment or both, under Title 18, United States Code, and that such willful false statements may jeopardize the validity of the application, any patent issuing thereon or any patent to which this signed statement is directed.

15
 20
 25
 30
 35
 40
 45
 50
 55
 60
 65
 70
 75
 80
 85
 90
 95
 100
 105
 110
 115
 120
 125
 130
 135
 140
 145
 150
 155
 160
 165
 170
 175
 180
 185
 190
 195
 200
 205
 210
 215
 220
 225
 230
 235
 240
 245
 250
 255
 260
 265
 270
 275
 280
 285
 290
 295
 300
 305
 310
 315
 320
 325
 330
 335
 340
 345
 350
 355
 360
 365
 370
 375
 380
 385
 390
 395
 400
 405
 410
 415
 420
 425
 430
 435
 440
 445
 450
 455
 460
 465
 470
 475
 480
 485
 490
 495
 500
 505
 510
 515
 520
 525
 530
 535
 540
 545
 550
 555
 560
 565
 570
 575
 580
 585
 590
 595
 600
 605
 610
 615
 620
 625
 630
 635
 640
 645
 650
 655
 660
 665
 670
 675
 680
 685
 690
 695
 700
 705
 710
 715
 720
 725
 730
 735
 740
 745
 750
 755
 760
 765
 770
 775
 780
 785
 790
 795
 800
 805
 810
 815
 820
 825
 830
 835
 840
 845
 850
 855
 860
 865
 870
 875
 880
 885
 890
 895
 900
 905
 910
 915
 920
 925
 930
 935
 940
 945
 950
 955
 960
 965
 970
 975
 980
 985
 990
 995
 1000
 1005
 1010
 1015
 1020
 1025
 1030
 1035
 1040
 1045
 1050
 1055
 1060
 1065
 1070
 1075
 1080
 1085
 1090
 1095
 1100
 1105
 1110
 1115
 1120
 1125
 1130
 1135
 1140
 1145
 1150
 1155
 1160
 1165
 1170
 1175
 1180
 1185
 1190
 1195
 1200
 1205
 1210
 1215
 1220
 1225
 1230
 1235
 1240
 1245
 1250
 1255
 1260
 1265
 1270
 1275
 1280
 1285
 1290
 1295
 1300
 1305
 1310
 1315
 1320
 1325
 1330
 1335
 1340
 1345
 1350
 1355
 1360
 1365
 1370
 1375
 1380
 1385
 1390
 1395
 1400
 1405
 1410
 1415
 1420
 1425
 1430
 1435
 1440
 1445
 1450
 1455
 1460
 1465
 1470
 1475
 1480
 1485
 1490
 1495
 1500
 1505
 1510
 1515
 1520
 1525
 1530
 1535
 1540
 1545
 1550
 1555
 1560
 1565
 1570
 1575
 1580
 1585
 1590
 1595
 1600
 1605
 1610
 1615
 1620
 1625
 1630
 1635
 1640
 1645
 1650
 1655
 1660
 1665
 1670
 1675
 1680
 1685
 1690
 1695
 1700
 1705
 1710
 1715
 1720
 1725
 1730
 1735
 1740
 1745
 1750
 1755
 1760
 1765
 1770
 1775
 1780
 1785
 1790
 1795
 1800
 1805
 1810
 1815
 1820
 1825
 1830
 1835
 1840
 1845
 1850
 1855
 1860
 1865
 1870
 1875
 1880
 1885
 1890
 1895
 1900
 1905
 1910
 1915
 1920
 1925
 1930
 1935
 1940
 1945
 1950
 1955
 1960
 1965
 1970
 1975
 1980
 1985
 1990
 1995
 2000
 2005
 2010
 2015
 2020
 2025
 2030
 2035
 2040
 2045
 2050
 2055
 2060
 2065
 2070
 2075
 2080
 2085
 2090
 2095
 2100
 2105
 2110
 2115
 2120
 2125
 2130
 2135
 2140
 2145
 2150
 2155
 2160
 2165
 2170
 2175
 2180
 2185
 2190
 2195
 2200
 2205
 2210
 2215
 2220
 2225
 2230
 2235
 2240
 2245
 2250
 2255
 2260
 2265
 2270
 2275
 2280
 2285
 2290
 2295
 2300
 2305
 2310
 2315
 2320
 2325
 2330
 2335
 2340
 2345
 2350
 2355
 2360
 2365
 2370
 2375
 2380
 2385
 2390
 2395
 2400
 2405
 2410
 2415
 2420
 2425
 2430
 2435
 2440
 2445
 2450
 2455
 2460
 2465
 2470
 2475
 2480
 2485
 2490
 2495
 2500
 2505
 2510
 2515
 2520
 2525
 2530
 2535
 2540
 2545
 2550
 2555
 2560
 2565
 2570
 2575
 2580
 2585
 2590
 2595
 2600
 2605
 2610
 2615
 2620
 2625
 2630
 2635
 2640
 2645
 2650
 2655
 2660
 2665
 2670
 2675
 2680
 2685
 2690
 2695
 2700
 2705
 2710
 2715
 2720
 2725
 2730
 2735
 2740
 2745
 2750
 2755
 2760
 2765
 2770
 2775
 2780
 2785
 2790
 2795
 2800
 2805
 2810
 2815
 2820
 2825
 2830
 2835
 2840
 2845
 2850
 2855
 2860
 2865
 2870
 2875
 2880
 2885
 2890
 2895
 2900
 2905
 2910
 2915
 2920
 2925
 2930
 2935
 2940
 2945
 2950
 2955
 2960
 2965
 2970
 2975
 2980
 2985
 2990
 2995
 3000
 3005
 3010
 3015
 3020
 3025
 3030
 3035
 3040
 3045
 3050
 3055
 3060
 3065
 3070
 3075
 3080
 3085
 3090
 3095
 3100
 3105
 3110
 3115
 3120
 3125
 3130
 3135
 3140
 3145
 3150
 3155
 3160
 3165
 3170
 3175
 3180
 3185
 3190
 3195
 3200
 3205
 3210
 3215
 3220
 3225
 3230
 3235
 3240
 3245
 3250
 3255
 3260
 3265
 3270
 3275
 3280
 3285
 3290
 3295
 3300
 3305
 3310
 3315
 3320
 3325
 3330
 3335
 3340
 3345
 3350
 3355
 3360
 3365
 3370
 3375
 3380
 3385
 3390
 3395
 3400
 3405
 3410
 3415
 3420
 3425
 3430
 3435
 3440
 3445
 3450
 3455
 3460
 3465
 3470
 3475
 3480
 3485
 3490
 3495
 3500
 3505
 3510
 3515
 3520
 3525
 3530
 3535
 3540
 3545
 3550
 3555
 3560
 3565
 3570
 3575
 3580
 3585
 3590
 3595
 3600
 3605
 3610
 3615
 3620
 3625
 3630
 3635
 3640
 3645
 3650
 3655
 3660
 3665
 3670
 3675
 3680
 3685
 3690
 3695
 3700
 3705
 3710
 3715
 3720
 3725
 3730
 3735
 3740
 3745
 3750
 3755
 3760
 3765
 3770
 3775
 3780
 3785
 3790
 3795
 3800
 3805
 3810
 3815
 3820
 3825
 3830
 3835
 3840
 3845
 3850
 3855
 3860
 3865
 3870
 3875
 3880
 3885
 3890
 3895
 3900
 3905
 3910
 3915
 3920
 3925
 3930
 3935
 3940
 3945
 3950
 3955
 3960
 3965
 3970
 3975
 3980
 3985
 3990
 3995
 4000
 4005
 4010
 4015
 4020
 4025
 4030
 4035
 4040
 4045
 4050
 4055
 4060
 4065
 4070
 4075
 4080
 4085
 4090
 4095
 4100
 4105
 4110
 4115
 4120
 4125
 4130
 4135
 4140
 4145
 4150
 4155
 4160
 4165
 4170
 4175
 4180
 4185
 4190
 4195
 4200
 4205
 4210
 4215
 4220
 4225
 4230
 4235
 4240
 4245
 4250
 4255
 4260
 4265
 4270
 4275
 4280
 4285
 4290
 4295
 4300
 4305
 4310
 4315
 4320
 4325
 4330
 4335
 4340
 4345
 4350
 4355
 4360
 4365
 4370
 4375
 4380
 4385
 4390
 4395
 4400
 4405
 4410
 4415
 4420
 4425
 4430
 4435
 4440
 4445
 4450
 4455
 4460
 4465
 4470
 4475
 4480
 4485
 4490
 4495
 4500
 4505
 4510
 4515
 4520
 4525
 4530
 4535
 4540
 4545
 4550
 4555
 4560
 4565
 4570
 4575
 4580
 4585
 4590
 4595
 4600
 4605
 4610
 4615
 4620
 4625
 4630
 4635
 4640
 4645
 4650
 4655
 4660
 4665
 4670
 4675
 4680
 4685
 4690
 4695
 4700
 4705
 4710
 4715
 4720
 4725
 4730
 4735
 4740
 4745
 4750
 4755
 4760
 4765
 4770
 4775
 4780
 4785
 4790
 4795
 4800
 4805
 4810
 4815
 4820
 4825
 4830
 4835
 4840
 4845
 4850
 4855
 4860
 4865
 4870
 4875
 4880
 4885
 4890
 4895
 4900
 4905
 4910
 4915
 4920
 4925
 4930
 4935
 4940
 4945
 4950
 4955
 4960
 4965
 4970
 4975
 4980
 4985
 4990
 4995
 5000
 5005
 5010
 5015
 5020
 5025
 5030
 5035
 5040
 5045
 5050
 5055
 5060
 5065
 5070
 5075
 5080
 5085
 5090
 5095
 5100
 5105
 5110
 5115
 5120
 5125
 5130
 5135
 5140
 5145
 5150
 5155
 5160
 5165
 5170
 5175
 5180
 5185
 5190
 5195
 5200
 5205
 5210
 5215
 5220
 5225
 5230
 5235
 5240
 5245
 5250
 5255
 5260
 5265
 5270
 5275
 5280
 5285
 5290
 5295
 5300
 5305
 5310
 5315
 5320
 5325
 5330
 5335
 5340
 5345
 5350
 5355
 5360
 5365
 5370
 5375
 5380
 5385
 5390
 5395
 5400
 5405
 5410
 5415
 5420
 5425
 5430
 5435
 5440
 5445
 5450
 5455
 5460
 5465
 5470
 5475
 5480
 5485
 5490
 5495
 5500
 5505
 5510
 5515
 5520
 5525
 5530
 5535
 5540
 5545
 5550
 5555
 5560
 5565
 5570
 5575
 5580
 5585
 5590
 5595
 5600
 5605
 5610
 5615
 5620
 5625
 5630
 5635
 5640
 5645
 5650
 5655
 5660
 5665
 5670
 5675
 5680
 5685
 5690
 5695
 5700
 5705
 5710
 5715
 5720
 5725
 5730
 5735
 5740
 5745
 5750
 5755
 5760
 5765
 5770
 5775
 5780
 5785
 5790
 5795
 5800
 5805
 5810
 5815
 5820
 5825
 5830
 5835
 5840
 5845
 5850
 5855
 5860
 5865
 5870
 5875
 5880
 5885
 5890
 5895
 5900
 5905
 5910
 5915
 5920
 5925
 5930
 5935
 5940
 5945
 5950
 5955
 5960
 5965
 5970
 5975
 5980
 5985
 5990
 5995
 6000
 6005
 6010
 6015
 6020
 6025
 6030
 6035
 6040
 6045
 6050
 6055
 6060
 6065
 6070
 6075
 6080
 6085
 6090
 6095
 6100
 6105
 6110
 6115
 6120
 6125
 6130
 6135
 6140
 6145
 6150
 6155
 6160
 6165
 6170
 6175
 6180
 6185
 6190
 6195
 6200
 6205
 6210
 6215
 6220
 6225
 6230
 6235
 6240
 6245
 6250
 6255
 6260
 6265
 6270
 6275
 6280
 6285
 6290
 6295
 6300
 6305
 6310
 6315
 6320
 6325
 6330
 6335
 6340
 6345
 6350
 6355
 6360
 6365
 6370
 6375
 6380
 6385
 6390
 6395
 6400
 6405
 6410
 6415
 6420
 6425
 6430
 6435
 6440
 6445
 6450
 6455
 6460
 6465
 6470
 6475
 6480
 6485
 6490
 6495
 6500
 6505
 6510
 6515
 6520
 6525
 6530
 6535
 6540
 6545
 6550
 6555
 6560
 6565
 6570
 6575
 6580
 6585
 6590
 6595
 6600
 6605
 6610
 6615
 6620
 6625
 6630
 6635
 6640
 6645
 6650
 6655
 6660
 6665
 6670
 6675
 6680
 6685
 6690
 6695
 6700
 6705
 6710
 6715
 6720
 6725
 6730
 6735
 6740
 6745
 6750
 6755
 6760
 6765
 6770
 6775
 6780
 6785
 6790
 6795
 6800
 6805
 6810
 6815
 6820
 6825
 6830